

A regular meeting of the Troy Planning Commission was held in Council Chambers, City Hall on Wednesday, January 22, 2025 at 3:30 p.m. with Chairman James McGarry presiding. ATTENDING: Members – McGarry, Oda, Emerick, Wolke, and Titterington; Development Staff – Eidemiller, Bruner and Burgei; and Development Director Davis.

REORGANIZATION: Following a motion of Mr. Titterington, seconded by Mayor Oda, that Mr. McGarry be elected Chair of the Commission and that Mr. Wolke be elected Vice-Chair of the Commission for 2025, both were elected by unanimous roll call vote.

APPOINTMENT TO CRA HOUSING COUNCIL FOR 3-YEAR APPOINTMENT COMMENCING 1-1-2025. (Mrs. Ehrlich's term expired 12-31-2024). By Ordinance, a member of the Planning Commission serves on the CRA Housing Council. Mr. McGarry stated he spoke with Mrs. Ehrlich, and she would be willing to be reappointed. Following the motion of Mayor Oda, seconded by Mr. Wolke, by unanimous roll call vote, Mrs. Ehrlich was reappointed to the CRA Housing Council for a new three-year term commencing 1-1-2025 through 12-31-2027.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Upon motion of Mr. Emerick, seconded by Mr. Titterington, the minutes of the December 11, 2024, meeting were approved by unanimous voice vote.

HISTORIC DISTRICT APPLICATION, CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 301 E. FRANKLIN STREET, REPLACE EXTERIOR WINDOWS AND REPLACE EXTERIOR SURFACES; OWNER – EVA ENRIGHT; APPLICANT - BRYAN WELLMANN, RELIABLE HOME IMPROVEMENTS. The staff report noted: property is zoned R-7, Multiple-Family Residential District; the Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) Form describes the building as a one and a half story vernacular cottage, built in 1911; the building is not listed on the National Register of Historic Places; this project received grant funding through the Ohio Department of Development's Lead Safe Ohio project; the contractor has verified that the windows and exterior walls are presumed to have lead paint due to visual signs and other inspection factors; the Contractor is a licensed Lead Abatement Contractor with the Ohio Department of Health; this finding has led to this request for window and exterior surface replacements; applicant wishes to replace the exterior windows with Jeld Wen, Siteline, double-hung pocket wood clad windows with the same opening characteristics and design elements as the original windows; these same windows were approved by the Commission for the property located at 321 W Franklin Street on October 9, 2024; applicant also wishes to replace the exterior surfaces with LP, engineered designed wood; exterior surfaces to be replaced include soffit, fascia, trim, and siding; colors being utilized will be Sand Dunes, Garden Sage, and Timberland Suede; existing wood surfaces are presumed to have lead paint; the wood appears to have some original characteristics, however, there are also signs of repairs that have been done; and the replacement engineered wood will match the look of the original but will be a more durable product with minimal maintenance moving forward. Staff recommends approval of the window & exterior surface replacements due to the risk associated with lead paint as well as the compliance with section 2.8 and 2.3 of the Design Manual. The proposed colors were viewed by the Commission.

Discussion. In response to Mr. Titterington staff indicated that encapsulating the wood trim is permitted instead of sanding and painting to remove lead based paint based on the long term life of encapsulating the wood.

In response to Mr. McGarry, staff stated that for this application the siding will be removed and replaced.

A motion was made by Mr. Wolke, seconded by Mayor Oda. to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 301 E. Franklin Street as submitted, based on the exact materials and colors set forth in the application and as viewed by the Commission, and based on the findings of staff.

MOTION ADOPTED, UNANIMOUS ROLL CALL VOTE

HISTORIC DISTRICT APPLICATION, CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 215 W. MAIN STREET, REPLACE 100 WINDOWS OF THE MAIMI COUNTY COURTHOUSE; OWNER/APPLICANT – BOARD OF MIAMI COUNTY COMMISSIONERS. Staff reported: the property is in the B-2 General Business District; it is on the National Register of Historic Places; the Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) Form lists this property as an outstanding example of late nineteenth century architecture being designed by J. W. Yost. Contributing features include: the four similar facades, with projecting columned porticos with crowning and balustrade and the column lined domes with a center statue. It is important to note that the windows are not listed as a contributing feature on the OHI Form however, this could be due to the significant amount of architectural details. The staff report further stated:

“ The Applicant has provided an example of two county courthouses that have undergone significant window replacements with a similar window product as proposed, specifically Williams County in Bryan, Ohio and Hardin County in Kenton, Ohio.

A narrative has been provided that outlines the current window conditions. These conditions include:

1. Rotting and warping of wooden frames, compromising structural integrity.
2. Air leaks and poor insulation, leading to energy inefficiencies.
3. Maintenance challenges, requiring frequent repairs and painting to prevent further deterioration.
4. Ten (10) windows have minimal functionality while all the other windows are not functioning.

The existing window color is a Sherwin Williams SW 6114 Bagel. The proposed window color is RAL 1019 Grey Beige. The new color is very similar in tones to the existing, just with less pink tones when natural and artificial light shine on it. It is important to note that the first-floor windows will included a laminated glaze over the glass due to a Secretary of State of Ohio requirement and the Board of Elections.

DESIGN MANUAL: (Staff analysis can be seen below in red following each item) 2.8 Windows:

- A. The position, number, and arrangement of original windows in a building should be preserved. **The position, number, and arrangement will be maintained.**
- B. If original windows are extensively deteriorated, only the deteriorated windows should be replaced. Avoid removing any that are still repairable. **While the windows could potentially be repaired, the replacement windows will match the existing design characteristics while improving the frequency of the maintenance. Only ten (10) windows are currently minimally functional.**
- C. Avoid enlarging or downsizing window openings to accommodate replacement window sizes. **The window openings will remain unaltered.**
- D. Replacement windows should match the appearance of the historic originals in number of panes, dimensions of sash members, and profile of sash members and muntins. Windows should simulate the operating characteristics of the originals. **The same material as the original windows, usually wood, should be used. The operating and design characteristics will match the existing. Although the replacement material will be aluminum, the long-term maintenance benefits and energy benefits should be noted.**
- E. Interior or exterior storm windows may be used to increase energy efficiency. These should be either a single pane or, if they have an upper and a lower pane, the division between the two should be at the meeting rails of the original exterior windows. Storm windows should match the color of the existing window trim. **N/A**
- F. Windows that have an original storm sash should be repaired and retained. **N/A** “

Staff recommended approval of the proposed window replacements as they meet Design Manual Section 2.8 A, B, E, and F.11.

Miami County Administrator Michael Clarey provided a power point presentation, which was in the Commission's agenda packet. Also attending were County Commissioner Westfall and Mandy Kim, representing the County's consultant Garmin Miller.

Discussion. Staff indicated that while the application is not using wood to wood and using aluminum constructed windows, the metal will replicate the look of the wood and provide a long lasting product. It was indicated that the proposed color of RAL 1019 Grey Beige matches the existing light fixtures on the Courthouse. Mr. Clarey stated that the replacement windows will cost \$1,600,000 as proposed and the cost would be \$3,000,000 if the replacement had to be with wood.

Ms Kim provided a sample of the metal window and the color palate.

Mr. Wolke noted that the Commission has approved similar applications that used aluminum windows when the proposed windows replicated the original.

Mayor Oda stated she supports historic preservation but can favor applications such as this with the material replicating the original, and the use of wood windows would be cost prohibitive.

A motion was made by Mr. Emerick, seconded by Mayor Oda, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 215 W. Main Street as submitted, based on the exact materials and color of RAL 1019 Grey Beige as set forth in the application and as viewed by the Commission, and based on the findings of staff.

MOTION ADOPTED, UNANIMOUS ROLL CALL VOTE

HISTORIC DISTRICT APPLICATION, CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 14 N. WALNUT STREET, EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS:

OWNER- CAREY CO., INC.; APPLICANT – ANDRE CIRCLE ARCHITECT LLC. Staff reported: the property is in the B-3, Central Business District; there is no OHI Form for this property. The staff report further stated:

“DISCUSSION:
East Façade (facing Walnut Street): Starting on the ground level, the CMU block will be painted Rookwood Dark Green from the current blue color. The existing brick on the front façade will remain unpainted. The storefront will be replaced with a new aluminum storefront in the Iron Ore color. On the upper stories, (elevation notes 9 & 10) the applicant is proposing a black metal roof and metal board and batten siding. This portion of the building had vinyl siding that was removed by the previous owner.

Improvements along the alley: The main building components will be painted Rookwood Green. A total of three (3) new aluminum storefronts will be installed along the alley. A fire rated egress door and fire rated coiling door will be installed next to the old storefront.

West façade (facing public square): The main body color of this façade will be painted Rookwood Green to match the rest of the building including the alley. The trim will be painted Iron Ore. The applicant is also proposing two (2) vinyl replacement windows on this façade.

It is important to note that the other repair items are being done prior to these alterations that include extensive tuckpointing, a header repair (that ties into the CAS building) and new gutters and downs.

- Design Manual:** (Staff Analysis can be seen below in red following each item). 2.6 Paint Colors:
- A. A concentration of similar colors on the same block should be avoided. **Similar colors are being avoided.**
 - B. Historically unpainted surfaces should not be painted. Historically painted surfaces should remain painted. **Historically unpainted surfaces will remain unpainted.**
 - C. Simpler buildings should have a simple color scheme. More ornate structures, such as larger Queen Anne styles, may incorporate three or more colors. **The color scheme is simple with two colors.**
 - D. Matte, flat, or semi-gloss paint should be used. Avoid high gloss paint. **High gloss paint is being avoided.**
 - E. In all circumstances, avoid bright and obtrusive colors, such as neon or day-glow hues. **Bright obtrusive colors are being avoided.**

- Design Manual 2.8 Windows**
- A. The position, number, and arrangement of original windows in a building should be preserved. **The position, number, and arrangement will be maintained.**
 - B. If original windows are extensively deteriorated, only the deteriorated windows should be replaced. Avoid removing any that are still repairable.
 - C. Avoid enlarging or downsizing window openings to accommodate replacement window sizes. **The window openings will remain unaltered.**
 - D. Replacement windows should match the appearance of the historic originals in number of panes, dimensions of sash members, and profile of sash members and muntins. Windows should simulate the operating characteristics of the originals. The same material as the original windows, usually wood, should be used. **The request is for vinyl and aluminum clad storefront windows. The windows on the west façade (facing public square) have one wood double hung window and one vinyl window. The windows along the alley have already been replaced with vinyl windows by a previous owner.**
 - E. Interior or exterior storm windows may be used to increase energy efficiency of existing windows. These should be either a single pane or, if they have an upper and a lower pane, the division between the two should be at the meeting rails of the original exterior windows. Storm windows should match the color of the existing window trim. **N/A**
 - F. Windows that have an original storm sash should be repaired and retained. **N/A** “

Staff recommended approval of the proposed alterations due to the compliance with Design Manual Sections 2.6 and 2.8.

Discussion. Mr. Circle, applicant, was present and advised that the plan is for residential on the third floor; offices on the second floor; and an aluminum storefront to replace the area that faces into the Square.

A motion was made by Mr. Titterington, seconded by Mayor Oda, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 14 N. Walnut Street as submitted, based on the exact materials and colors as set forth in the application, and as viewed by the Commission, and based on the findings of staff.

MOTION ADOPTED, UNANIMOUS ROLL CALL VOTE

OTHER: Regarding 15 S. Market Street, owner Beth Kerber, staff commented that an incomplete application had been received, and staff required additional inFormation before the Commission could review the application. It was noted that an application presented to the Commission had been approved, but paint was actually applied to a different storefront, and the painting of that storefront had to be addressed. Staff also noted there was a doorway that needed additional inFormation. This item is to be on the next meeting agenda with the additional inFormation provided.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:06 p.m. upon motion of Mr. Emerick, seconded by Mayor Oda, and approved by unanimous voice vote.

Respectfully submitted,

_____Chairman

_____Secretary

[Note – Prior to the meeting, the Oath of Office was administered to Mrs. Ehrlich, who had been reappointed to a new six- year terms of 1-1-2025/12-31-2030].